Accepted paper for publication in Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism
16 messages

JEMT - ASERS Publishing <asers.jemt@gmail.com>   15 February 2022 at 14:12
To: nurdin@stp-andung.ac.id, hel@stp-bandung.ac.id, fap@stp-bandung.ac.id

Dear Authors,

Because we have technical problems with our platform and e-mails, we inform you in this way that the paper STAKEHOLDERS' SYNERGIES IN DEVELOPING SMART TOURISM DESTINATION: A PHENOMENOGRAPHIC STUDY is accepted to be published in Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism, volume XIII, Issue 2(58) Spring 2022.

During the preparation of your manuscript for publication, please keep in mind the requirements listed below. Please attend to these requirements and return your paper with your proof until 28th of February:

- Your references should be written in accordance with Numeric Style. Please omit the reference which is not used in your paper. Your paper will be assigned with a DOI and will benefit from all the advantages of CrossRef System. For this consideration we kindly ask you to assign the DOI to your references, where this is the case.

- Not use any abbreviation in the title and subtitles;

- Only the cited documents should be included in the references;

- Use green colour (1-87-40 colour code) when you draw the graphic;

- The manuscript file must be in MS Word format only (not PDF) and should be formatted ready for publication, using to Full Paper Template attached;

- Please double check title, author(s)' names, affiliations, address, country and authors' contact information, and references;

- Please submit your double-checked full paper and sign the copyright form and the publishing agreement in the attachments.

After the publication, your paper will be visible in all the databases in which JEMT is currently indexed. I would like to inform you that our journal is being re-evaluated at SCOPUS and we are awaiting the result of this evaluation.

Also, let me inform you that the publishing fee in JEMT is 400 euro /paper and the payment will be performed in the following account:

Bank: ING Office Cuza Craiova, No 42, bl 6A, Alexandru Ion Cuza Street, Craiova, Romania IBAN
Account in Euro: RO19INGB0000999904254019
Swift code: INGBROBU
Beneficiary/Account holder: ASERS SRL

All fees derived by the bank transfer will be supported by the sender. Please mention on the payment form that the fee is for publishing in JEMT and your name (e.g. for JEMT_Issue_Smith). Please send a scanned copy of Payment Form (Bank Transfer) by email to: jemt@aserspublishing.eu.

If you need a proforma invoice to make the payment, please give me details for payment.

Best regards,
PhD Ramona Pirvu - Editor in Chief of Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism

3 attachments

📄 **JEMT_Copyright Agreement.pdf**
168K

📄 **JEMT_Publishing Agreement 2022.pdf**
296K

📄 **JEMT_Full_Paper_Template.docx**
39K

Fajar Putra <fap@stp-bandung.ac.id>   15 February 2022 at 16:22
To: Nurdin Hidayah <nurdin@stp-bandung.ac.id>

Kind regards,

Dr Fajar Putra, CHE
Assistant Professor at STP Bandung, Indonesia

[Quoted text hidden]

Fajar Putra <fap@stp-bandung.ac.id>   16 February 2022 at 10:31
To: JEMT - ASERS Publishing <asers.jemt@gmail.com>, Ramona PIRVU <jemt@aserspublishing.eu>

Dear Dr Ramona Pirvu - Editor in Chief of Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism

Thank you for the confirmation related to our manuscript submission title: STAKEHOLDERS' SYNERGIES IN DEVELOPING SMART TOURISM DESTINATION: A PHENOMENOGRAPHIC STUDY at your esteemed Journal of Environmental Management and Tourism. We try to compile with the new format of JEMT given, and will revise the manuscript on or before 28 february 2022. For the proof of our acceptance article and administration purposes we would like to request a letter of acceptance (LOA) from your journal.

Finally, we would like to ask you a favour in preparing proforma invoice to our institution in details for payment as follow:
Dr Herlan Suherlan (Associate professor)
Tourism Department
Sekolah Tinggi Pariwisata Bandung
Dr Setiabudi 186, Bandung 40141
West Java, Indonesia

We will wait for your future confirmation and documents (invoice and LOA).

Kind regards,

Fajar Putra

Dr Fajar Putra CHIA., CHE
Assistant Professor (Lektor) at Sekolah Tinggi Pariwisata NHI Bandung

Comments From reviewer/s	Please explain if you agree with these comments
1. Tittle: ○ Suggestion for accuracy of the tittle: ***Stakeholders' Synergies in Developing Smart Tourism Destination. A Phenomenographic Study***	Thank you for your comments, we are agreeing with Reviewer comments
2. Abstract ○ Check whether the phenomenology / phenomenography approach is correct, and suggestions to add in the methodology section of the definition and steps in its use relevant to this study. ○ How the interview data is analyzed is still not presented clearly in the section methodology	○ Thank you for your comments, Phenomenography should be o Tools using Nvivo, data analysis by doing: 1. Data condensation, 2. Data display, and 3. Concluding drawing/verification (Miles, Huberman & Saldana, 2014)
3. Introduction ○ Paragraph 1 line 5: Check citations? What is meant is: Hidayah, N. (2020). Smart Tourism: Accentuation of Homestay Readiness in the Special Economic Zone of Tanjung Lesung, Pandeglang-Banten. Tourism Media, 18(1), 101-112. ○ Paragraph 2 Line 9: an example of implementing smart tourism ○ o Paragraph 4: In this paragraph it would be better to compare and contrast the research that has been done in terms of stakeholder inclusion. ○ Paragraph 5: Examples of actors / stakeholders? ○ Paragraph 6: I wonder the research questions and objectives based on the results of the discussion in section 4. Check again whether the objectives and research questions. This should be appropriate, based on the findings presented in this study.	○ Thank you for your comments these are lists of references: Hidayah, N. & Herlan S. (2020). Smart Tourism: Accentuation of Homestay Readiness in the Tanjung Lesung Special Economic Zone, Pandeglang-Banten. Tourism Media, 18(1), 101-112. ○ Thank you for your comments for Example: New York depeloping Big Apple smart city using IoT & connected devices; Singapore installing lots of sensors around the city; Barcelona provides free wifi nearly everywhere in the city, creating a series of apps to keep citizens & tourists informed and engaged in what's going in, use of Internet of Things technologies including smart sensors to reduce energy costs and increase road safety. ○ Thank you for your comments, paragraph 4 has been revised (please see full text). ○ Thank you for your comments, examples of actors: Visitors, Tourism Suppliers, Communities, Government, Media & Academia (Hidayah, 2021). ○ Thank you for your comments, Paragraph 5 example of stakeholders are: Local government, local media, local tourism business, Tourism community, travel blogger. ○ Thank you for your comments, paragraph 6 we have revised the manuscript accordingly.

Comments From reviewer/s	Please explain if you agree with these comments
4. Literature Review o the composition of the literature review was changed to: 2.1 Smart tourism (main topic) 2.2 Stakeholder Theory 2.3. Stakeholders' synergies (approach) o Paragraph 2 (stakeholder theory): Researchers have previously identified specific stakeholder groups' attitudes towards tourism, such as…………	o Thank you for your comments, we are agreed with the compostion suggestions o Thank you for your comments, We are using theories from : Fernando Martin Y. Roxas, John Paolo R. Rivera, Eylla Laire M. Gutierrez, 2020):
o Previous studies in the field of tourism using stakeholder / stakeholder theory (GAP research). Reasons for using stakeholder theory...	o Thank you for your comments, we use stakeholder teory because it can reveal the interests and influences of the different stakeholders, and determine whether their interactions are conflicting, complementary, or cooperative (Reed et al., 2009; Heslinga, Peter Groote & Frank Vanclay, 2019). While literature emphasized the value of stakeholder participation in pursuing sustainability by identifying who the stakeholders are and what their roles are, there is a need to further investigate their interaction with each other, more specifically how this interaction modify their roles and responsibilities, as well as, how their interactions can aid in achieving sustainability, particularly SDG17 – partnership for the goals (Fernando Martin Y. Roxas, John Paolo R. Rivera, Eylla Laire M. Gutierrez, 2020).
5. Method o Section 3.1 Research Design, you can explain a little about the interview protocol here and each section that asks about aspects of: - Problems in implementing smart tourism. - Efforts made in implementing smart tourism. - The main factors in the development of smart tourism o Section 3.2 Data Collection, the reason for choosing Wonosobo as the context of this research. Please brief description of tourism in Wonosobo is explained: - Geographical conditions - Favorite tourist attraction - Stakeholders involved there	o Thank you for your comments. First, we conduct a literature study on the important matters of the three research questions, then note the important points in the interview guide. Second, the key informant was determined by a representative from the district government, namely the Wonosobo Kadispar. Third, the interview was conducted by asking general questions about the development of smart tourism in Wonosobo, then to questions about the problems in implementing smart tourism, the efforts made in terms of implementing smart tourism and the main factors in developing smart tourism. The last question to the key informants is asking which parties can be used as further informants to verify answers so that the validity & credibility of the research is fulfilled. So, from one informant to another on the basis of directions from previous informants or what is commonly called a snowball interview. o Thank you for your comments. The reason for choosing Wonosobo is because according to the Kadisbudpar of Central Java Province, Central Java has gone digital since 2014. Central Java E-Tourism and

- Implementation of existing smart tourism o Cross check the number of participants whether 5 people or six according to the description consisting of local government, mass media, tourism businesses, GenPi, local tourism community, and travel bloggers o Suggestions for adding tables 1. Demographics interviewed participants o Adding an explanation regarding the data collection process and the ongoing interviews with the participants o Section 3.3. Data Analysis, state and explain the name of the model developed by Dey, 1993? o Explain again in detail the process of analyzing data in this section, including the process of transcription, manual data tabulation / using software, determination of codes, categories and concepts. Are there references in this process either previous research / other research method books? o Section 3.4 Data validation, mention references for triangulation. o Who are the supervisors and other parties related to the focus of the study?	Wonosobo became one of the one district in Central Java was chosen, this is because stakeholder involvement there was good enough, so researchers were curious to explore how stakeholders were involved there in building smart tourism. o Thank you for your comments. Geographical conditions & others please help. The stakeholders involved there are in accordance with the information from the informants, namely the Government, Media, tourism service providers (Private), Pokdarwis, and Bloggers such as GENPI. o Thank you for your comments 5 informants including: o Thank you for your comments. Interviews were conducted in convenience, namely making appointments according to the convenience of the informants, either at a restaurant, at the office, or at their home. The interviews took place in depth with an average duration of 1-2 hours. o Thank you for your comments. Section 3.3 I am attaching the full research report. o Thank you for your comments. We attached the full research report. o Thank you for your comments. In section 3.4 we used: Creswell (2010); Denzin, N. K., & Lincoln, Y. S. (2008) supervisors and other parties related to the focus of the study?actually this is not done, so it should just be deleted

Table embedded in right column:

Participants	Gender	Type of stakeholder Code
Participant one	Male	Local government
Participant two	Male	
Participant three	Male	Local tourism three
Participant four	Male	?

6. Results and Discussion o Section 4.1 challenges for smart tourism, Examples of inconsistent application of tourism policies included? o Paragraph 4 Line 4, what is a tourism business registration certificate? o Suggestion to replace the findings image with table 2, 3, and 4 in the discussion section. O Section 4.2 Efforts in Realizing Smart Tourism Destination, still unclear what	o Thank you for your comments, in section 4.1. replacement of official figure (PIC) always causes inconsistent or the policy is not continued by the replacement official, because in Indonesia the average policy is created because of the taste of officials. o Thank you for your comments, what we mean here is the legality of the tourism business, one of which is TDUP. o Thank you for your comments we have revised the findings using tables. o Thank you for your comments, in section 4.2. This means that a website or mobile apps-based hub or anchor is needed to integrate other sectors such as the creative industry (souvenirs), agriculture/fisheries/livestock (food raw materials), transportation etc.

is meant by integration of terminals with other sectors here?	
o Section 4.2 Informant 1 quote: In this section I am still confused about what is meant by collaborative governance, who are the managers? Applying for entrance fees?	o Thank you for your comments, in section 4.2 Quote: meaning that collaboration with interested parties is needed in managing e-ticketing, because so far these parties (BPW/APW/local guide, etc.) manage sales (ticketing) individually (each) and uncoordinated so that it does not make it easier for customers and there is no standard price.
o Section 4.2 Paragraph 3, examples from internal and external parties?	o Thank you for your comments, in section 4.2 the Internal parties examples: internal stakeholders from Wonosobo destinations such as tourist attraction entrepreneurs, food/drink accommodation entrepreneurs, transportation providers, BPW/APW, etc. For the External parties' examples: visitors, BPW/APW from outside (offline/online), competing and complementary destinations, provincial/central government, etc.
o Example of coordination between local government and stakeholders	o Examples of local government coordination and stakeholders: coordination of promotions, coordination of branding, coordination of Sapta Pesona/Sadar Wisata, coordination of ticketing, coordination of price standards, etc.
o Who is meant by communication and information service here?	o Communication and information service: Ministry of Communication and Informatics telecommunications (TELKOM?) and banking are not included as participants because in the view of the key informants and other informants Telkom and Banking are not internal stakeholders in Wonosobo, they are extensions of the center, or those in Wonosobo are only branches. Likewise, with academia, in Wonosobo there are no universities involved in tourism development.
o Why are academia, Indonesia telecommunications and banking not included as participants? Are there any reasons stated by the respondents for choosing related stakeholders (banking)?	o Reasons given by respondents for choosing related stakeholders (banking)? (Already answered maybe above).
o Section 4.2 paragraph 5, can you explain in more detail the other media used here	o Other medias included: Facebook, Instagram, Blogger, Traveloka
o Can you explain in more detail the association referred to here?	o Travel bogger is an association of Wonosobo promotional content writers in the form of a blog. Local tourism communities are local communities related to tourism activities such as Pokdarwis, Genpi, homestay associations and Asita
o Can other types of training be mentioned by the respondent	o There are no other types of training.
o Section 4.2 paragraph 6, can you explain how Pokdarwis promotes accommodation in local destinations?	o Pokdarwis promotes accommodation through Traveloka

o Section 4.3, Can you specifically mention here the regional and regional government in question?	o Regional government: Central Java provincial government, surrounding regional governments: Banjarnegara Regency, Kendal Regency, Batang Regency, Temanggung Regency, Magelang Regency, Purworejo Regency, Kebumen Regency, Banjarnegara Regency, Kebumen Regency.
o Examples of synergies carried out between local governments in the form of……	o Synergy carried out between local governments in the form of: transportation system integration, joint promotion, complementary (non-competitive) tour package policies, data & information sharing to optimize Central Java E-Tourism initiated by the provincial government.
7. Clarity of writing o Please do check again the writing of the paper. Some mistakes are found such as typo, punctuation mark. We must try to proofread the paper.	Thank you for your comments we will proofread the paper.
8. References o the citation format for the JEMT journal uses the Chicago referencing format. References will be updated and use the help of the Endnote reference manager.	Thank you for your comments we will adjust the list of references using reference management software